# **BMJ Open** Epidemiological transition: a historical analysis of immigration patterns by country of origin (1861–1986) related to circulatory system diseases and all-cause mortality in twentieth-century Australia

Cecily C Kelleher <sup>1</sup>, <sup>1</sup> Gabrielle E Kelly <sup>1</sup>, <sup>2</sup> Ricardo Segurado, <sup>3</sup> Jonathan Briody, <sup>4</sup> Alexander M Sellers, <sup>5</sup> Janet McCalman<sup>6</sup>

#### To cite: Kelleher CC,

Kelly GE, Segurado R, *et al.* Epidemiological transition: a historical analysis of immigration patterns by country of origin (1861–1986) related to circulatory system diseases and all-cause mortality in twentiethcentury Australia. *BMJ Open* 2023;**13**:e070996. doi:10.1136/ bmjopen-2022-070996 ABSTRACT

Prepublication history and additional supplemental material for this paper are available online. To view these files, please visit the journal online (http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/ bmjopen-2022-070996).

Received 11 December 2022 Accepted 27 October 2023



© Author(s) (or their employer(s)) 2023. Re-use permitted under CC BY-NC. No commercial re-use. See rights and permissions. Published by BMJ.

For numbered affiliations see end of article.

Correspondence to Dr Cecily C Kelleher; cecily.kelleher@ucd.ie

Background and objectives Circulatory system disease (CSD) patterns vary over time and between countries, related to lifestyle risk factors, associated in turn with socioeconomic circumstances. Current global CSD epidemics in developing economies are similar in scale to those observed previously in the USA and Australasia. Australia exhibits an important macroeconomic phenomenon as a rapidly transitioning economy with high immigration throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. We wished to examine how that historical immigration related to CSD patterns subsequently. Methods and setting We provide a novel empirical analysis employing census-derived place of birth by age bracket and sex from 1891 to 1986, in order to map patterns of immigration against CSD mortality rates from 1907 onwards. Age-specific generalised additive models for both CSD mortality in the general population, and allcause mortality for the foreign-born (FB) only, from 1910 to 1980 were also devised for both males and females. Results The percentage of FB fell from 32% in 1891 to 9.8% in 1947. Rates of CSD rose consistently, particularly from the 1940s onwards, peaked in the 1960s, then declined sharply in the 1980s and showed a strong period effect across age groups and genders. The main effects of age and census year and their interaction were highly statistically significant for CSD mortality for males (p<0.001, each term) and for females (p<0.001, each term). The main effect of age and year were statistically significant for all-cause mortality minus net migration rates for the FB females (each p<0.001), and for FB males, age (p<0.001) was significant.

**Conclusions** We argue our empirical calculations, supported by historical and socioepidemiological evidence, employing immigration patterns as a proxy for epidemiological transition, affirm the life course hypothesis that both early life circumstances and later life lifestyle drive CSD patterns.

#### INTRODUCTION

Circulatory system disease (CSD) patterns, including ischaemic heart disease and stroke, are known to vary over time and between

### STRENGTHS AND LIMITATIONS OF THIS STUDY

- ⇒ An original analysis employing census data and immigration patterns to reinterpret historical trends in circulatory system disease (CSD) in Australia.
- ⇒ Relevant to modern public health policy for population approaches to CSD prevention, also integrates life course and lifestyle drivers of trends.
- ⇒ Historical databases do not categorise either allcause or CSD mortality according to country of origin.
- ⇒ However, data for foreign-born mortality were inferred using novel actuarial type calculations.
- ⇒ There are no second-generation data by country of origin, unlike in USA.

Ξ countries, related to lifestyle risk factors across the life course, associated in turn with underlying socioeconomic circumstances.<sup>1-6</sup> ≥ Current global epidemics in developing economies are similar in scale to those observed much earlier in the USA and Australia.<sup>7 8</sup> Bu Since the mid-twentieth century in particular, international epidemiological studies have assessed how proximal lifestyle risk factors such as tobacco smoking and diet-related hypertension, obesity and lipoprotein profiles can explain the patterns of heart disease and ଟି stroke in given population.<sup>7–13</sup>

It is well established that in that period, patterns of heart disease were highest in countries such as the USA, Australia and Finland, intermediate in northern Europe and lowest in Mediterranean countries.<sup>14</sup> That pattern shifted, with steep declines observed first in the USA and Australia, followed by falls in all western countries from the early 1980s onwards.<sup>14</sup> <sup>15</sup> The conventional, primarily period, explanation is that the balance of lifestyle change and introduction of rigorous clinical management protocols, including coronary care and pharmacological management of hypertension and hypercholesterolaemia, drive these patterns.<sup>5 7 11 16 17</sup>

The concept of epidemiological transition posits that as countries move from patterns of poverty to patterns of affluence, changes in prevailing diseases occur, with first infectious diseases waning, followed by a rise in noncommunicable diseases.<sup>1 18 19</sup> The American Heart Association describes four distinct stages of epidemiological transition at population level.

The contemporary global burden of disease maps shows clearly the shifting patterns downwards in current western populations and upwards in parts of Asia and Africa.<sup>20</sup> Moreover, in a time of huge global challenge in relation to non-communicable disease and the rise of obesity in recent decades, it is necessary to understand at a mechanistic level how global epidemics occur to intervene effectively in their management.<sup>21-24</sup> An assessment of how historical patterns of disease occurred<sup>45721</sup> can contribute to modern strategies to prevent non-communicable disease.<sup>6</sup>

The USA, Australia and New Zealand share an important macroeconomic phenomenon in that they were each rapidly developing transitional economies throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, with large-scale immigration as a major driver of population growth and composition.<sup>15</sup> In both continents, the original immigrants were predominantly from Europe, initially from northern and then Central Europe, followed by Southern Europe and then latterly from Asia.<sup>25–27</sup> A previous analysis employing historical US census data showed a strong temporal association between the patterns of age-adjusted heart disease in both men and women and the proportion of foreign-born and of first-generation Americans between 38 and 50 years earlier.<sup>15</sup>

Our objective in this current analysis was to examine whether historical census immigration patterns in Australia by country or origin related to subsequent allcause and CSD mortality patterns during the twentieth century and thereby establish if a pattern similar to that in the USA existed.

#### **METHODS**

#### Data

To examine the transitioning population and its subsequent pattern of CSD, we looked at both census data and epidemiological records and constructed a historical dataset based on digitised paper records. Census data on place of birth, age bracket and sex were retrieved from scanned paper copies from 1891 over the subsequent 95 years coming to 13 in total-every 10 years between 1891 and 1921, 1933, 1947, 1954 and then every 5 years from 1961 to 1986.<sup>28</sup> Prior to 1891, there was not a synchronised census year for all six pre-Federation colonies; however, an overall number of foreign-born residents were obtained for 1861, 1871 and 1881 (not by region).

We reconciled the country of birth data across changes of political entities into the following: Commonwealth of Australia (the six colonies/states, External Territories and New Zealand), UK and Ireland, northern and Central Europe (including Denmark, Sweden and Norway, Germany, The Netherlands, Belgium, France, Switzerland, Austria/Austria-Hungary, eastern Europe through to Russia), Southern Europe (all other countries with extensive Mediterranean sea coasts including Spain, Italy, Greece, Malta, Yugoslavia and other Balkan nations, Turkey, and Lebanon, in addition to Portugal, Romania and Bulgaria), with the Americas, Asia, Africa and Polynesia grouped into the Other group including the small number of persons unknown, or born at sea. The percentage of the total population which was born in each of the world regions was calculated. As the predominant immigrant population of Australia historically has been from the UK and Ireland, we also created an aggregated European and Other region, to include all non-UK/Irish immigration.

Age-specific and age-adjusted CSD mortality rates per 100000 were available from 1907 to 2016 from online records of the General Record of Incidence of Mortality use (GRIM; Australian Institute of Health and Welfare) book 0900.<sup>29</sup> The GRIM mortality information is obtained from (compulsory) death certificates, certified by a medical practitioner or coroner, and coded by the Australian Bureau of Statistics or precursors to that agency, to International Statistical Classification of Diseases and Related e Health Problems (ICD). CSD currently encompasses ICD-10 codes I00-I99, including all forms of heart disease and stroke and is aligned with corresponding categories back to ICD-1 (1907–1917). Coronary heart disease deaths specifically (ICD-10 codes I20-I25) were considered but were only available starting in 1940. We obtained incidence of aggregated cerebrovascular disease (CVD) ≥ mortality from GRIM book 0904 (Australian Institute of training, and Health and Welfare), encompassing ICD-10 codes I60 to I69. All mortality rates are age-standardised to the 2001 estimated resident Australian population.

#### Patient and public involvement statement

None. This is a historical analysis of archived publicly available datasets, with no patient or public involvement.

Analysis Age-specific all-cause mortality rates for the whole Austra-lian population are also compared with those foreignborn.<sup>30 31</sup> CSD mortality rates are available only for the whole Australian population, but there is justification that these are indicative of all-cause mortality rates, in the relevant period.<sup>57911</sup> For each sex/age group/census year, mortality rates due to CSD in the Australian population were calculated by taking the ratio N\_mort/N\_total in the raw dataset.

Mortality rates for foreign-born due to circulatory disease or all causes are not readily available either, as country of origin was not recorded at death. However,

l simi

all-cause mortality rates for foreign-born were estimated from numbers of foreign-born in different age groups at different census years, using the following actuarial type/ analytical method, set out in detail below. For example, let fb denote foreign-born, and taking a specific age and specific year, then

Number fb age 31 in 1948 = (Number fb age 30 in 1947)  $\times$  (1- (r<sub>1</sub>-r<sub>2</sub>)), where r<sub>1</sub> is the mortality rate for fb age 30 in 1947 and r<sub>9</sub> is the inward migration rate for age 30 in 1947–1948. Let  $r=r_1-r_2$  then we rewrite the above equation as:

Number fb age 31 in 1948 = (Number fb age 30 in 1947)  

$$\times (1 - r)$$
(1)

Thus, r is the mortality rate-inward migration rate for the fb age 30 in 1947.

Then

Number fb age 32 in 1949 = (Number fb age 31 in 1948) (2) $\times (1 - r)$ 

where  $r=r_1-r_9$  and  $r_1$  is the mortality rate for fb age 31 in 1948–1949 and  $r_0$  is the inward migration rate for age 31 in 1948-1949 and we assume these rates are unchanged from the 1947-1948 values.

Thus, by substituting equation (1) into equation (2), we have

Number fb age 32 in 1949 = (Number fb age 30 in 1947)

 $\times (1 - r)^2$ 

Proceeding in this way we have

= (Number fb age 30 in 1947) Number fb age 37 in 1954

$$((1 - r)^{7})$$

Therefore

(Number fb age 37 in 1954/ Number fb age 30 in 1947) =  $(1 - r)^7$ 

and therefore

r = 1 - (Number fb age 37 in 1954/Number fb age 30 in 1947)  $^{1/7}$ (3)

Thus, r is the mortality rate-inward migration rate for the fb age between 30 and 36 per year in the interval 1947-1954.

r is estimated from the data by

 $r = 1 - (N_AllFB \text{ age } 35 - 45 \text{ in } 1954 / N_AllFB \text{ age } 25 - 35 \text{ in } 1947)^{1/7} (4)$ 

This calculation was repeated for each age group and census interval. Only raw data by age group totals are available from the censuses. Note that r can be negative if the inward migration rate exceeds the mortality rate. Thus, for all age groups, r will underestimate the mortality rates but it is used here as a proxy for the mortality rates. Essentially, equations (1)-(4) use a geometric mean of 1-r over an age group/census interval to estimate r, and this is repeated for different age groups/census intervals.

The estimates of r over time and across age groups were calculated as above. These estimates were interpolated and smoothed over all ages and census years using a tensor product smooth model<sup>32</sup> and are displayed in 3D plots. This is an extension of a generalised additive model (gam)<sup>33</sup> to three dimensions and was fitted using the mgcv package in R with the ti function. This was done separately for males and females. This smooth model **Open access** 

e

≥

was decomposed into a functional analysis of variance (ANOVA) structure with main effects of age and year and their interaction, and p values for these effects were obtained. The CSD mortality rates per 100000 for the whole population were also fitted using a tensor smooth model and displayed in 3D plots.

Note that the raw data are very variable both by census year and age group. For example, the number of foreignborn female age group 30 in 1921 was 74913, while it was 100 385 in 1933, and for age group 40 in 1921, it was 93089. So, all interpolating models must be interpreted with caution.

However, model checking was carried out using the 9 gam.check function in the mgcv package in R, and this function was also used to find the best basis dimension 8 for the terms in the model. In additional model validation, the standard deviation  $(\sigma)$  of the estimated rates r from equations (1)-(4) were computed separately for males and females and the rates were then perturbed by adding a uniform random number on  $(0, \sigma)$  and the analuding ysis repeated on the perturbed rates. This was repeated 20 times. for uses rela

#### RESULTS

The exact population numbers from 1891 to 1986 from census data by region of origin are presented in table 1. This shows respectively the population numbers born ç in Australia or abroad or the birthplace of origin as a percentage of the total population, from 1891 onwards. There are two distinct patterns observed. In 1891 when the population numbered just over three million, the proportion foreign-born was relatively high. The contribution made to the population composition by those UK or Irish-born is initially very considerable but tails off until the 1940s. A new surge in migration beginning after World War II (WW2) is apparent, initially comprising an increase in European (mostly Southern) immigration. Asian populations in particular were the predominant group in the large 'Other' category after the 1970s.

The Australian population composition mapped against the age-adjusted CSD mortality is shown in figure 1A. This illustrates the change in the proportions of the population foreign-born by region of origin (left-hand vertical axis), alongside the change in incident mortality due to all CSD (red line, right-hand vertical axis). This shows first that the percentage of the population foreign-born **o** was over 60% in 1861 and declined steeply over the next & 80 years so that it was just 10% by the mid-1940s. Thereafter, there was again a rise in immigration, climbing to over 20% of the population in the early 1980s. The figure also shows the contribution to this pattern made by the UK/Ireland, northern and Southern European groups. The predominant early group is of UK and Irish origin, dropping steeply by the mid-1940s and plateauing at approximately 7%. The other two European groups are much smaller in proportion and reached their peak in the 1960s.

Year	UK/Ireland n (%)	Northern Europe n (%)	Southern Europe n (%)	Other place of origin n (%)	All foreign-born n (%)	Australian born n (%)	Total
1891	821 166 (26%)	75145 (2.4%)	5307 (0.2%)	113799 (4%)	1015417 (32%)	2158975 (68%)	3174392
1901	679159 (18%)	67291 (2.0%)	7382 (0%)	111666 (3%)	865 498 (23%)	2908303 (77%)	3773801
1911	591 729 (13%)	63594 (1.4%)	9348 (0.2%)	122664 (3%)	787335 (17.7%)	3667670 (82.3)	4455 005
1921	676387 (12%)	52503 (1.0%)	15539 (0.3%)	109118 (2%)	853547 (15.7%)	4581663 (84.3%)	5435210
1933	732674 (11%)	48 125 (0.7%)	44 680 (0.7%)	94860 (1%)	920339 (13.8%)	5726566 (86.2%)	6646905
1947	542910 (7%)	50180 (0.7%)	58516 (0.8%)	90995 (1%)	742601 (9.8%)	6835171 (90.2%)	7577772
954	664205 (7%)	294667 (3.3%)	196 192 (2.2%)	39756 (0%)	1 194 820 (13.4%)	7700064 (86.6%)	8894 884
961	755402 (7%)	433999 (4.1%)	406791 (3.9%)	178612 (2%)	1774804 (16.9%)	8729406 (83.1%)	10504210
966	908664 (8%)	430574 (3.7%)	554273 (4.8%)	237 409 (2%)	2130920 (18.4%)	9419542 (81.6%)	11550462
971	1088210 (9%)	475095 (3.7%)	633 173 (5.0%)	382840 (3%)	2579318 (20.2%)	10176320 (79.8%)	12755638
976	1117600 (8%)	460673 (3.4%)	632 550 (4.7%)	508209 (4%)	2719032 (20.1%)	10829617 (79.9%)	13548649
981	1 132 599 (8%)	471278 (3.2%)	678 445 (4.7%)	900143 (6%)	3182465 (21.8%)	11393865 (78.2%)	14576330
986	1 127 191 (7%)	488 825 (3.1%)	662 124 (4.2%)	1213554 (8%)	3491694 (22.4%)	12110456 (77.6%)	15602150

The pattern of circulatory diseases shows a steep rise throughout the early twentieth century and reaches a plateau by 1950–1970 and then declines sharply from then onwards. By 1990, rates had fallen again to those previously seen in 1920 and continued to decline before levelling off currently.

Figure 1B shows the contrast between males and females in age-adjusted CSD mortality, this time in relation to the population foreign-born of both sexes from UK and Ireland. There is an approximate time lag of 40 years in the fall-off of immigration from UK and Ireland and that of age-adjusted CSD in the general population. Female and male rates began to diverge in the 1940s–1950s, with female rates declining earlier, and male rates not beginning to decline until the 1980s. By the late 1990s, the rates had converged again. The pattern in figure 1C showing the CVD mortality by sex aligns with this, although with negligible sex differences: an increase as the late nineteenth century immigrants reach old age, a plateau from the 1950s to 1970s, followed by steep decline thereafter.

Figure 2A, B show mortality rates due to circulatory disease in the Australian population by age group and year during the period 1910 to 1990 for males and females separately. Mortality rates increase with age as expected and can be seen from the left scales. In all age groups and in both males and females, rates of circulatory disease rose consistently, particularly from the 1940s onwards, peaked in the late 1960s and then began to decline sharply by the 1980s. An interaction effect between age and year is clearly visible, with differences between ages changing with year. The main effects of age and census year and their interaction were statistically significant in the model for males (p<0.001, each term) and for females (age, interaction, p<0.001 each term, year, p=0.01). The adjusted  $R^2$  was 98% for the male model and 96.4% for the female model.

Figure 3A, B show all-cause mortality-net migration rates for the foreign-born only, separately for both males and females. The main effect of age and year were statistically significant in the model for females (p<0.001 for both) and the interaction term (p=0.040) was also significant. The adjusted  $R^2$  was 51.1% for the male model and 72.5% for the female model. No model inadequacies were found using the function gam.check. The model validation using perturbed rates found that statistical conclusions remained the same in 20 checks for males. For females, the main effects were significant in the 20 checks, while the interaction term was borderline significant (p<0.10 in 18 of 20 checks). Thus, the statistical conclusions are unchanged.

The number of non fb at each census year and age ð group was found by subtracting the N AllFB from N a total. Equations (1)-(4) were then carried out for the non fb, and the models were fitted on these data. Figure 4A, B show all-cause mortality-net migration rates for the ≥ non-foreign-born only, separately for both males and females. The main effect of age was statistically significant in the model for females (p<0.001) and the interaction ğ term (p<0.001) was also significant. For males, all three terms age, year and the interaction (p<0.001 for each) were significant. The adjusted  $R^2$  was 71.3% for the male S model and 81.1% for the female model. No model inadequacies were found using the function gam.check. The model validation using perturbed rates found that statistechnologies tical conclusions remained the same in 20 checks.

### DISCUSSION

In this analysis, we have examined whether the immigration pattern in Australia, as one form of proxy for epidemiological transition, related to patterns of both CSD and all-cause mortality in the population, as had been observed previously in the USA.<sup>15</sup> We demonstrate a temporal association of age-adjusted CSD with immigration approximately a half century earlier from predominantly the UK and Ireland, which changes as





C Sex-specific irish/British-born census respondents against age-adjusted cerebrovascular disase mortality for the Total Australian population



(A) Timeline of foreign-born census respondents Figure 1 1861–1986 and age-adjusted circulatory system disease (CSD) mortality for the total Australian population. (B) Sexspecific Irish-born/British-born census respondents and ageadjusted CSD mortality for both males and females in the Australian population. (C) Sex-specific Irish-born/British-born census respondents against age-adjusted cerebrovascular disease mortality for the total Australian population.

the population stabilises economically and newer waves of immigration from lower-risk Mediterranean and later Asian countries occur.

We also show in age-specific models that assess both CSD and all-cause mortality, a strong age and period effect for the general Australian population and a highly significant interaction between age and census year in CSD mortality. Both foreign-born male and female populations showed a strong age effect for all-cause mortality, while for females the interaction term for age and year was also significant. A similar period impact is also seen for the general population less the migrant groups. These

novel findings do not contradict the period impact on cardiovascular disease shown in a previous age-periodcohort analysis undertaken<sup>5</sup> for the general Australian population, but is unlike that analysis in showing a clear interaction effect, and for the first time looks specifically also at the foreign-born population.

#### **STRENGTHS**

This is an original analysis employing census data and **u** immigration patterns to reinterpret historical trends in CSD in Australia. It is relevant to modern public health policy for population approaches to CSD prevention ŝ and also integrates life course and lifestyle drivers of trends. We demonstrate in essence, for Australia, similar 8 temporal findings to those observed in the USA.

Our findings can be situated in the earlier history of that transitioning Australian development. To understand any cohort effect, we contend the historical developments influencing early childhood must be considered. Of the three classical risk factors, active individual smoking is strongly period driven,<sup>79</sup> whereas dietary intake, which drives both lipoprotein and blood pressure patterns, uses related can be influenced both by short-term and longer-term programming factors.<sup>6 23 24</sup>

#### LIMITATIONS

We acknowledge there are clear limitations to this current analysis in that the historical databases do not categorise either all-cause or CSD mortality according to country of origin and there are no available second-generation data by country of origin. However, data for foreign-born were inferred using actuarial type calculations, and a three-dimensional model, representing a novel approach and model validation, was carried out with unchanged conclusions.

tra One would expect an impact on foreign-born, but also their children born into a transitioning economic ng, environment, especially urban disadvantage. In the previous analysis in the USA, data were available both for foreign-born and native-born of foreign parents and that afforded a fit which explained both the rise and fall of the epidemic;<sup>15</sup> however, we do not have second-generation DEMOGRAPHIC TRANSITION The actuarial approach we have taken is in keeping s

with the demographic evidence base. Borrie provided a comprehensive analysis of the transitioning Australian and New Zealand populations over a 200-year period from 1788 to 1988.34 Those who migrated into Australia from Europe<sup>35-37</sup> included First Fleeter and other colonists, transported convicts and assisted passage individuals who were supported to emigrate from their countries of origin. The Irish and British were the predominant early migrating group. A total of over 800 000 immigrants came

5

te

ő

ta

ģ

simi

lar



Figure 2 Circulatory system disease mortality rates per 100000 by age and year in the general Australian population, (A) males and (B) females. The unlabelled axis is age in both plots.

also through Government Assistance programmes established 1861-1865 to 1900, tapering off sharply during that time. Irish-assisted emigration to Australia was related to workhouse programmes established during and after the Great Irish famine.<sup>36 37</sup> The impact of historical circumstances, including the famine in Ireland in the 1840s, has been examined previously in an Irish context, both at home and in relation to its huge emigrant diaspora in the USA.<sup>38 39</sup> An analysis of birthplace of all brides marrying in Australia between 1908 and 1979 shows the transition to Australian-born mothers almost fully completed by  $1979^{34}$  and family size fell from 5.6 to 2.8.

The salmon bias evaluated in other period migrations suggests that older emigrants with established illness returning home might impact mortality.<sup>40</sup> There is no information on those who might have left Australia in the electronic databases, though our calculations are based on net migration between census points which include

Protected by copyright, including both incoming and outgoing migrants as estimated at the time. Borrie<sup>34</sup> reports some such movement, particularly vounger, working males who followed employment across uses related Australia after the goldrush period, but because of the distance from Europe and the various costly transportation and assisted passage schemes, returning numbers to country of origin would have been limited in scale. There was no accurate measure of settler flows until after ð WW2. Until then, according to Borrie, 'arrivals minus departures' between 1860 and 1986 showed a net positive migration of 4.77 million inwards.<sup>34</sup>

Whitewell et al conducted a detailed economic and public health review of Australia from 1860 to 1940 which illustrates how and when population changes occurred which might have influenced longer-term health outcomes into the twentieth century.<sup>41</sup> Height, as a proxy measure for public health impact of standards of living, was initially high, dipped in the mid-nineteenth century



Figure 3 All-cause mortality-net migration rates per 100000 by age group and year for Australian foreign-born population, (A) males, (B) females. Age groups 2-6 correspond to age midpoints 20, 30,40, 50 and 60 years old, respectively. Both plots have been rotated with an angle of -35 degrees to permit a better view.

ð

text and

da ta

ล



Figure 4 All-cause mortality-net migration rates per 100 000 by age group and year for the Australian non-foreign-born population, (A) males, (B) females. Age groups 2-6 correspond to age midpoints 20, 30, 40, 50 and 60 years old, respectively.

and then rose again from the late 1890s to 1918. From 1890 onwards, the sanitary conditions in the booming cities, which initially made for an unhealthy environment in which children were especially vulnerable, greatly improved. Inwood et al show an association between growing incomes and height in Tasmania related to a decline in food cost and increased per capita domestic product.<sup>42</sup> Cumpston<sup>25</sup> documented the improvements in public health in Australia that would translate into reduced susceptibility to strokes and heart disease in these individuals as older adults. Taylor et al reviewed both all-cause mortality in Australia from 1788 to  $1990^{43}$ and more recent cause-specific mortality from 1907 to 1990.<sup>44</sup> They showed a precipitous fall in infant mortality from 1900, similar to European countries, but then a stagnation during the mid-twentieth century, attributable to the epidemic in CSD mortality.

There is now a strong body of recently assembled historical retrospective cohort studies that afford an opportunity to review social and economic circumstances in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries when Australia was becoming established as a modern economy and when cardiovascular diseases incidence and mortality were rising.<sup>45–50</sup> McCalman *et al* linked medically validated morbidity and mortality records to original maternity records from the Melbourne lying-in hospital<sup>45 46</sup> showing expected demographic predictors of infant mortality. These included reduced odds of that outcome if of a higher social group and of Australian birth and higher odds if a first-born child, younger mother, preterm and of relatively lower birth weight.<sup>46</sup> Early results from the Victoria Diggers to Veterans longitudinal study of World War I enlisters showed a strong social gradient according to military rank for height, and among survivors to 1922, farmers were significantly less likely to die compared with others.<sup>50</sup>

food availability, exposing a transitioning population to **5** prevailing adverse lifestyle.<sup>7 9</sup> McMichael was an early proponent that general population drivers explained proponent that general population drivers explained the rise in cardiovascular diseases including food supply factors, underpinned by industrialisation.<sup>59</sup>

a Those studies at the height of the epidemic focused not primarily on the early British migrants but on the latterly arrived mainly Southern European immigrants who initially carried the reduced risk associated with their Mediterranean lifestyle into a now economically stable Australian society (online supplemental table 1). Italian and Greek immigrants to cities like Melbourne and Sydney initially had lower blood pressure and lipid profiles than their Australian-born contemporary neighbours but had higher risk factor profiles than their home countries.<sup>51-54</sup> The classical healthy migrant hypothesis posits that immigrants move from low to intermediate to high risk as they transition into a new environment<sup>60</sup> though migrants usually form a relatively small part of the population, which is more typical of the later immigration patterns seen since the mid-twentieth century in Australia. The post-WW2 immigrants assume the risk of the prevailing environment as they enter middle and old age.

The observed differences in mortality rates between men and women<sup>3-5</sup> have been variously attributed to a biological female hormonal advantage and less adverse lifestyle, but this difference remains unexplained.<sup>21</sup> It is likely that the effect of smoking is underestimated in these early epidemiological analyses. A key factor, active

tex

smoking in the post-WW2 period, was extraordinarily high, particularly in men in both Europe, the USA and Australia.<sup>61 62</sup> Exposure to high levels of unrestricted active smoking would increase the risk of passive smoke exposure in public places and in households and transport, as with contemporary data.<sup>63</sup>

### **AN INTEGRATED APPROACH**

The epidemiological focus has moved more recently to a more integrated life course explanation for development of adult non-communicable disease that takes account of early life exposures as well as personal health behaviours.<sup>6</sup> <sup>14</sup> <sup>21–23</sup> Policy should be directed at underlying drivers of population health as well as individual risk factor modification, as exemplified by current guidelines for management of hypertension.<sup>6</sup> Current rates of CSDs are now much higher in Aboriginal citizens.<sup>64</sup> Emerging contemporary data from newer studies support the life course hypothesis also.<sup>65–69</sup> Data from a historical New Zealand cohort have modelled the significant effects of birth weight on subsequent adult blood pressure.<sup>68</sup>

In conclusion, this analysis provides a contextual reassessment of the historical drivers of the patterns of CSD in Australia. These different immigrant groups all experienced a period effect in relation to CSD, but also brought with them cohort effects of differing magnitude, which impacted CSD rates in the general population. These findings may be particularly relevant to public health policy planning for contemporary movements of peoples.

#### **Author affiliations**

<sup>1</sup>University College Dublin, Dublin, Ireland

<sup>2</sup>School of Mathematical Sciences, University College Dublin, Dublin, Ireland

<sup>3</sup>CSTAR, School of Public Health, Physiotherapy and Population Science, University College Dublin, Dublin, Ireland

<sup>4</sup>Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Division of Population Health Sciences, Dublin, Ireland

<sup>5</sup>Royal Adelaide Hospital Cardiology Services, Adelaide, South Australia, Australia <sup>6</sup>University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia

Acknowledgements The authors wish to thank Ms Emma Coyle for the work on data entry for this analysis and Dr Alexander Douglass for assistance with the presentation of figures. Professor Cecily Kelleher undertook the original research in Australia on which this paper is based on a Miegunyah Fellowship at the University of Melbourne. Dr Jonathan Briody was a member of the Health Research Board SPHERE PhD training programme. Professor Janet McCalman is supported by the ARC, Australian Research Council.

**Contributors** CCK conceived the study design, wrote the first draft and is the guarantor for the study. JM contributed to the historical economic and public health context for Australia in the nineteenth and early twentieth century. AMS and CCK conducted the literature search for contemporary Australia. JB initiated the construction of the database and RS conducted the temporal analysis. GEK devised and conducted the age period analysis for the general Australian-born and foreign-born populations. All authors contributed to the interpretation of findings and to the drafting of the manuscript and agreed to its final content. Data files of these analyses may be provided, upon reasonable request, by the authors.

**Funding** The authors have not declared a specific grant for this research from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

Competing interests None declared.

Patient and public involvement Patients and/or the public were not involved in the design, or conduct, or reporting, or dissemination plans of this research.

Patient consent for publication Not applicable.

Ethics approval This analysis employed publicly available archived databases with no individual participants so ethical approval was not sought or required.

Provenance and peer review Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

Data availability statement Data are available in a public, open access repository. No additional data available.

Supplemental material This content has been supplied by the author(s). It has not been vetted by BMJ Publishing Group Limited (BMJ) and may not have been peer-reviewed. Any opinions or recommendations discussed are solely those of the author(s) and are not endorsed by BMJ. BMJ disclaims all liability and responsibility arising from any reliance placed on the content. Where the content includes any translated material, BMJ does not warrant the accuracy and reliability of the translations (including but not limited to local regulations, clinical guidelines, terminology, drug names and drug dosages), and is not responsible for any error and/or omissions arising from translation and adaptation or otherwise.

**Open access** This is an open access article distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited, appropriate credit is given, any changes made indicated, and the use is non-commercial. See: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/.

#### **ORCID** iDs

Cecily C Kelleher http://orcid.org/0000-0001-9548-4914 Gabrielle E Kelly http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2769-9555

#### REFERENCES

- 1 Yusuf S, Reddy S, Ounpuu S, *et al.* Global burden of cardiovascular diseases. part 1: general considerations, the epidemiologic transition, risk factors and impact of urbanisation. *Circulation* 2001;104:2746–53.
- 2 Yusuf S, Hawken S, Ounpuu S, et al. Effect of potentially modifiable risk factors associated with myocardial infarction in 52 countries (the INTERHEART study): case control study. *Lancet* 2004;364:937–52.
- 3 Capewell S, O'Flaherty M. What explains declining coronary mortality? Lessons and warnings. *Heart* 2008;94:1105–8.
- 4 Allender S, Scarborough P, O'Flaherty M, et al. Patterns of coronary heart disease mortality over the 20th century in England and Wales: possible plateaus in the rate of decline. *BMC Public Health* 2008;8:148.
- 5 Taylor R, Page A, Danquah J. The Australian epidemic of cardiovascular mortality 1935-2005: effects of period and birth cohort. *J Epidemiol Community Health* 2012;66:e18.
- 6 Olsen MH, Angell SY, Asma S, et al. A call to action and a lifecourse strategy to address the global burden of raised blood pressure on current and future generations: the lancet commission on hypertension. *Lancet* 2016;388:2665–712.
- 7 Dwyer T, Hetzel BS. A comparison of trends of coronary heart disease mortality in Australia, USA and England and Wales with reference to three major risk factors-hypertension, cigarette smoking and diet. *Int J Epidemiol* 1980;9:65–71.
- 8 Stamler J, Kjelsberg M, Hall Y, *et al.* Epidemiologic studies on cardiovascular diseases: III. analysis of mortality by age-sexnationality. *J Chronic Dis* 1960;12:464–75.
- 9 Hetzel BS, Charnock JS, Dwyer T, et al. Fall in coronary heart disease mortality in U.S.A. and Australia due to sudden death: evidence for the role of polyunsaturated fat. J Clin Epidemiol 1989;42:885–93.
- 10 Goff DC, Howard G, Russell GB, et al. Birth cohort evidence of population influences on blood pressure in the USA, 1887-1994. Ann Epidemiol 2001;11:271–9.
- 11 Hetzel BS, Dwyer T. Response to: Tobias et al. on the decline of CHD mortality in New Zealand. Aust N Z J Public Health 2008;32:579–80.
- 12 Tobias M, Chan WC, Wright C, et al. Can the incidence and prevalence of coronary heart disease be determined from routinely collected national data? population-based estimates for New Zealand in 2001–03. Aust N Z J Public Health 2008;32:24–7.
- 13 Thompson PL, Hobbs MS, Martin CA. The rise and fall of ischemic heart disease in Australia. *Aust N Z J Med* 1988;18:327–37.
- 14 Harper S, Lynch J, Smith GD. Social determinants, and the decline of cardiovascular diseases: understanding the links. *Annu Rev Public Health* 2011;32:39–69.

## <u>ð</u>

### **Open access**

- 15 Kelleher CC, Lynch JW, Daly L, *et al.* "The "Americanisation" of migrants: evidence for the contribution of Ethnicity, social deprivation, lifestyle and life-course processes to the Mid-20Th century coronary heart disease epidemic in the US". *Soc Sci Med* 2006;63:465–84.
- Li Y, Pan A, Wang DD, et al. Impact of healthy lifestyle factors on life expectancies in the US population. *Circulation* 2018;138:345–55.
   Marmot MG, Adelstein AM, Bullisu L, Lessons from the study of
- Marmot MG, Adelstein AM, Bulusu L. Lessons from the study of immigrant mortality. *Lancet* 1984;1:1455–7.
   McKeown RE. The epidemiologic transition: changing patterns
- 10 INICKEOWN RE. The epidemiologic transition: changing patterns of mortality and population dynamics. *Am J Lifestyle Med* 2009;3(1 Suppl):19S–26S.
- 19 Cappuccio FP. Commentary: epidemiological transition, migration and cardiovascular disease. *Int J Epidemiol* 2004;33:387–8.
- 20 World health Organisation. Available: https://www.who.int/news/item/ 09-12-2020-who-reveals-leading-causes-of-death-and-disabilityworldwide-2000-2019 [Accessed 12 Nov 2022].
- 21 Nikiforov SV, Mamaev VB. The development of sex differences in cardiovascular disease mortality: a historical perspective. *Am J Public Health* 1998;88:1348–53.
- 22 Block T, El-Osta A. Epigenetic programming, early life nutrition and the risk of metabolic disease. *Atherosclerosis* 2017;266:31–40.
- Dickinson H, Moss TJ, Gatford KL, et al. A review of fundamental principles for animal models of Dohad research: an Australian perspective. J Dev Orig Health Dis 2016;7:449–72.
   Lindblom R, Ververis K, Tortorella SM, et al. The early life origin
- 24 Lindblom R, Ververis K, Tortorella SM, *et al*. The early life origin theory in the development of cardiovascular disease and type 2 diabetes. *Mol Biol Rep* 2015;42:791–7.
- 25 Cumpston JHL. The development of public health in Australia. Med J Australia 1928;1:332–6. 10.5694/j.1326-5377.1928.tb40853.x Available: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/toc/13265377/1/11
- 26 Carpenter N. Immigrants and their children. A study based on census statistics relative to the foreign born and the native white of foreign or mixed parentage; 1927. Census monographs VII Washington Department of Commerce, Bureau of the census
- 27 Winslow C-EA, Wang PL. The relation between changes in nationality stock and increasing death rates in adult life. *Am J Hyg* 1931;14:79–88.
- 28 Australian Bureau of Statistics. Available: http://www.abs. gov.au/AUSSTATS/abs@.nsf/ViewContent?readform&view= ProductsbyCatalogue&Action=Expand&Num=2.2 [Accessed 12 Jan 2019].
- 29 Australian Institute of health and welfare. Available: https://www. aihw.gov.au/reports-data/health-conditions-disability-deaths/heartstroke-vascular-diseases/overview [Accessed 12 Jan 2019].
- 30 Cleveland WS, Grosse E, Shyu WM. Chapter 8 of statistical models. In: Chambers JM, Hastie TJ, eds. *Local regression models*. New York: Wadsworth & Brooks/Cole, 1992: 68.
- 31 R Core Team. R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R foundation for statistical computing. 2017. Available: https://www.R-project.org/
- 32 Wood SN. Low rank scale invariant Tensor product smooths for generalized additive mixed models. *Biometrics* 2006;62:1025–36.
- 33 Wood SN. Generalized additive models. In: Generalized additive models: an Introduction with R. 2nd edition. Chapman and Hall/CRC Press, 2017.
- 34 Borrie WD. The European peopling of Australasia. A demographic history 1788-1988. Canberra: The Australian National University, 1994: 403.
- 35 Hughes R. *The fatal shore*. London: Vintage Books. Random House, 2003: 688.
- 36 Caball KM. The Kerry girls. Emigration and the earl grey scheme. Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2014: 192.
- 37 Reid RE. Farewell my children. Irish assisted emigration to Australia 1848-1870. Australia: Anchor Books, 2011: 221–51.
- 38 Kelleher CC, Lynch J, Harper S, et al. How social capital failed to save the Irish from cardiovascular disease in the USA. Am J Public Health 2004;94:2162–9.
- 39 Harding S, Balarajan R. Patterns of mortality in second generation Irish living in England and Wales: longitudinal study. *BMJ* 1996;312:1389–92.
- 40 Puschmann P, Donrovich R, Matthijs K. Salmon bias or red herring?: comparing adult mortality risks (ages 30-90) between natives and internal migrants: stayers, returnees and movers in Rotterdam, the Netherlands, 1850-1940. *Hum Nat* 2017;28:481–99.
- 41 Whitewell G, de Souza C, Height NS. Health and economic growth in Australia, 1860-1940. National Bureau of Economic Research 1997:379–422.
- 42 Inwood K, Maxwell-Stewart H, Oxley D, et al. Growing incomes, growing people in nineteenth-century Tasmania. Aust Econ Hist Rev 2015;55:187–211.

- 43 Taylor R, Lewis M, Powles J. The Australian mortality decline: allcause mortality 1788-1990. Aust N Z J Public Health 1998;22:27–36.
- 44 Taylor R, Lewis M, Powles J. The Australian mortality decline: cause-specific mortality 1907-1990. Aust N Z J Public Health 1998;22:37–44.
- 45 Mccalman J, Morley R. Mothers' health and babies' weights: the biology of poverty at the Melbourne lying-in hospital, 1857-83. Soc Hist Med 2003;16:39–56.
- 46 Morley R, McCalman J, Carlin JB. Birthweight and coronary heart disease in a cohort born 1857-1900 in Melbourne, Australia. Int J Epidemiol 2006;35:880–5.
- 47 McCalman J, Morley R, Mishra G. A health transition: birth weights, households and survival in an Australian working-class population sample born 1857-1900. Soc Sci Med 2008;66:1070–83.
- 48 Bradley J, Kippen R, Maxwell-Stewart H, et al. Research NOTE: the founders and survivors project. *The History of the Family* 2010;15:467–77.
- 49 McCalman J, Smith L, Silcott S, et al. Koori health research database: Dataset of genealogies and life events of approximately 8,000 Kooris who lived in Victoria and New South Wales in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries; 2018. Sch of rural healthAvailable: https://figshare.com/articles/Koori\_Health\_ Research\_Database/5936884
- 50 McCalman J, Kippen R, McMeekan J, et al. Early results from the diggers to veterans longitudinal study of Australian men who served in the first World War. Short and Long-Term Mortality of Early Enlisters Historical Life Course Studies 2019;8:52–72.
- 51 Lovell RR, Prineas RJ. n.d. Differences in blood pressure measurements and prevalence of hypertension between Australian-born and Italianborn middle-aged men and women in Melbourne. 1974. *Med J Aust*;21(2(25)):893–8.
- 52 Ulman R, Abernethy JD. Blood pressure and length of stay in Australia of Italian immigrants in the Australian national blood pressure study. Int J Epidemiol 1975;4:213–5.
- 53 Ireland PD, Giles GG. Blood pressure in the Australian-and Italian-born: a Melbourne suburb revisited after 20 years. *Aust N Z J Public Health* 1996;20:143–8.
- 54 Armstrong BK, Margetts BM, Masarei JRL, et al. Coronary risk factors in Italian migrants to Australia. Am J Epidemiol 1983;118:651–8.
- 55 McMichael AJ, McCall MG, Hartshorne JM, et al. Patterns of gastrointestinal cancer in European migrants to Australia: the role of dietary change. Int J Cancer 1980;25:431–7.
- 56 McMichael AJ, Giles GG. Cancer in migrants to Australia: extending the descriptive epidemiological data. *Cancer Res* 1988;48:751–6.
- 57 McMichael AJ, Bonett Ă, Roder D. Cancer incidence among migrant populations in South Australia. *Med J Aust* 1989;150:417–20.
- 58 Burvill PW, McCall MG, Woodings T, et al. Comparison of suicide rates and methods in English, Scots and Irish migrants in Australia. Soc Sci Med 1983;17:705–8.
- 59 McMichael AJ. Coronary heart disease: interplay between changing concepts of aetiology, risk distribution and social strategies for prevention. *Community Health Stud* 1989;13:5–13.
- Fennelly K. The healthy migrant effect. *Healthy Generations* 2005;5:1–3.
  Graham H. Smoking prevalence among women in the European
- Community 1959-1990. *Soc Sci Med* 1996;43:243–54. 62 Greenhalgh EM, Scollo MM, Winstanley MH. Tobacco in Australia: facts
- and issues. Melbourne: cancer council victoria, . 2022Available: www. TobaccolnAustralia.org.au
- 63 Frazer K, Callinan JE, McHugh J, et al. Legislative smoking bans for reducing harms from secondhand smoke exposure, smoking prevalence and tobacco consumption. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2016;2.
- 64 Hoy WE, Mott SA, McLeod BJ. Transformation of mortality in a remote Australian aboriginal community: a retrospective observational study. BMJ Open 2017;7:e016094.
- 65 Feng X, Wilson A, Courvoisier DS. Getting bigger quicker? Gendered socioeconomic trajectories in body mass index across the adult lifecourse: a longitudinal study of 21,403 Australians. *PLoS ONE* 2015;10:e0141499.
- 66 Najman JM, Aird R, Bor W, et al. The generational transmission of socioeconomic inequalities in child cognitive development and emotional health. Soc Sci Med 2004;58:1147–58.
- 67 Huang RC, Burrows S, Mori TA, *et al.* Lifecourse adiposity and blood pressure between birth and 17 years old. *Am J Hypertens* 2015;28:1056–63.
- 68 Roberts E, Wood P. Birth weight and adult health in historical perspective: evidence from a new Zealand cohort, 1907-1922. Soc Sci Med 2014;107:154–61.
- 69 Dancause KN, Mutran D, Elgbeili G, *et al.* Dietary change mediates relationships between stress during pregnancy and infant head circumference measures: the Qf2011 study. *Matern Child Nutr* 2017;13:e12359.